



**INTERNATIONAL COCOA ORGANIZATION
ORGANISATION INTERNATIONALE DU CACAO
МЕЖДУНАРОДНАЯ ОРГАНИЗАЦИЯ ПО КАКАО
ORGANIZACION INTERNACIONAL DEL CACAO**

FFP/REP/7
20 April 2019

Original: ENGLISH
Distr: RESTRICTED

**MEETING OF THE AD HOC PANEL
ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX C OF THE ICA, 2010**
Heden Golf Hotel, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire

**REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE AD HOC PANEL
ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX C OF THE ICA, 2010**

(12 – 13 APRIL 2019)

REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX C OF THE ICA, 2010

OPENING OF THE MEETING

1. The seventh meeting of the ICCO *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine or Flavour Cocoa for the review of Annex “C” of the International Cocoa Agreement, 2010 was opened by its Chairman, Mr. Edward S. Seguine of Seguine Cacao Cocoa & Chocolate Advisors, USA.

2. The Chairman thanked the experts of the Panel and welcomed all participants to the meeting. In his introductory remarks, the ICCO Executive Director, Mr. Michel Arrion recalled the importance of the fine or flavour cocoa production as a way to improve cocoa farmers’ revenues. He also invited all ICCO Member countries and the experts of the Panel to take part in the ongoing process for the revision of the International Cocoa Agreement, 2010 by providing feedback and suggestions on the corresponding sections of the Agreement.

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

3. The draft agenda contained in document FFP/7/1 was adopted. At the request of the representative of Ecuador, additional information was provided by the Panel of experts on the definition of Fine or Flavour Cocoa, as contained in the document FFP/5/2/Rev.1.

ICCO ANTITRUST LAW STATEMENT

4. All meetings of the *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine or Flavour Cocoa are required to be conducted in accordance with the relevant competition and antitrust laws. In this respect, the Chairman provided a statement regarding the confidentiality of the information disclosed during the meeting.

OVERVIEW OF THE SUBMISSION OF TECHNICAL DOSSIERS

5. The Secretariat had received a total of twenty dossiers by 15 March 2019. Sixteen of them were submitted by countries already listed in the 2015 revised Annex “C” (i.e. document FF/4/5)¹, whereas the remaining four were requests for inclusion into Annex “C” (i.e. Brazil, Guyana, Haiti and Malaysia).

NOMINATION OF A SPOKESPERSON FOR EACH COUNTRY SUBMITTING A PRE-DOSSIER AND IN ATTENDANCE

6. Based on the dossiers submitted to the ICCO Secretariat, the sequence of presentations was agreed among the participating countries.

PRESENTATION AND REVIEW OF COUNTRY DOSSIERS

7. The country dossiers were presented before the Panel of Experts in the following order:

¹ Seven countries previously listed in the 2015 revised Annex C did not submit a country dossier: six non-Member countries—Belize, Bolivia, Honduras, Mexico, São Tomé and Príncipe, Vietnam – and Venezuela.

Madagascar

8. Mr. Thomas WENISH, from the Conseil National du Cacao (CNC), stressed the progress made in implementing the National Cocoa Plan by modernizing the cocoa sector and improving internal quality controls. He asked to maintain the status of the country as exporting 100% of fine or flavour cocoa beans. The Panel requested clarifications on the determinants of cocoa price along the value chain, on the quality controls currently in place, and on the origins of the planting materials.

Nicaragua

9. Mr. Jose Miguel OBANDO ESPINOZA, from the *Instituto Nicaragüense de Tecnología Agropecuaria* (INTA), requested to maintain the status of the country as exporting 100% of fine or flavour cocoa. The experts asked for additional information on the quality and unit price of cocoa exports to El Salvador and Guatemala.

Ecuador

10. Mr. Luis RUEDA DAHIK, from the Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock of Ecuador, outlined the progress made to valorise the aromatic potential of the CCN51 variety during the fermentation and drying process. He requested to recognize Ecuador as a 90% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel asked for clarifications on the awards and the premium price received by the variety CCN51.

Dominican Republic

11. Mr. Melido Idelfonso MEDINA GARCIA, from the Ministry of Agriculture, emphasized the awards and the high prices received by the Dominican Republic's cocoa beans. He requested to have the Dominican Republic recognized as a 65% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The experts noted that the dossier lacked economic and sensorial information related to the pre-fermented Sanchez cocoa.

Peru

12. Mr. Oscar ROCA FERRAND, from the Peruvian Embassy in South Africa, outlined the genetic heritage of the Peruvian cocoa sector and the internal quality controls. He requested to maintain the status of the country as exporting 75% of fine or flavour cocoa. Members of the Panel asked for clarifications on the geographic expansion of the variety CCN51 and on the export volumes of organic and certified cocoa.

Colombia

13. HE Mrs. Claudia TURBAY QUINTERO, Ambassador of Colombia to Ghana, presented the country's cocoa sector and requested for Colombia to be recognized as exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel noticed the lack of evidence supporting the segregation of fine or flavour cocoa from the CCN51 variety.

Indonesia

14. Dr. Ir MISNAWI, from the Indonesian Coffee and Cocoa Research Institute (ICCRI), requested for Indonesia the status of 1.1% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The experts noted some discrepancies regarding the data on production and exports of cocoa beans.

Brazil

15. Mr. Fernando Antônio TEIXEIRA MENDES, from the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Food Supply (MAPA), requested a recognition of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel asked for clarifications on the production areas of fine or flavour cocoa and noted the low volumes of cocoa exports.

Costa Rica

16. HE Mrs. Marta Eugenia JUAREZ RUIZ, Ambassador of Costa Rica to Kenya, requested to maintain the status of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The members of the Panel asked for additional information on the low prices fetched by beans exported to Panama.

Papua New Guinea

17. Mr. David YINIL, from the Cocoa Board of Papua New Guinea, presented the country's efforts to tackle the issue of smoke taint in cocoa beans with postharvest techniques and export quality controls, and requested that Papua New Guinea be maintained as 90% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa.

Dominica

18. Mrs. Elizabeth JOHNSON from the *Instituto Interamericano de Cooperación para la Agricultura* (IICA) requested to maintain the status of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel encouraged the country to assess the damages caused by the storm Maria in 2017 and to carry out a gap analysis so as to promptly rebuild the sector.

Guatemala

19. Mr. Marlon Fernando AC PANGAN from the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Food highlighted the country's adoption of a National Cocoa Plan and the awards received by Guatemala's cocoa beans. He requested the recognition of the status of 81.4% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The experts asked for clarifications on the quality and prices of the beans exported to El Salvador and Honduras as well as additional information on postharvest procedures.

Grenada

20. Mr. Benjamin FIGAREDE, from Valrhona, highlighted the consistently high quality of Grenada's cocoa exports and requested to maintain the status of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. Members of the Panel asked for additional information on domestic processing and the origin of the varieties currently present on the island.

Guyana

21. Mrs. Elizabeth JOHNSON from the *Instituto Interamericano de Cooperación para la Agricultura* (IICA) represented Guyana at the meeting. The Panel of experts noted the lack of information provided in the country's dossier and recalled that only exports of cocoa beans are accounted for. The experts invited the country to resubmit their case at the next meeting of the *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine or Flavour Cocoa Panel and to provide more information regarding exports of fine or flavour cocoa beans.

Haiti

22. Mrs. Elizabeth JOHNSON from the *Instituto Interamericano de Cooperación para la Agricultura* (IICA) briefed the Panel about the country's areas of production and the cocoa supply chain. She requested Haiti be recognized as 4.1 % exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel requested clarification on the fermentation process as well as on the cocoa export volumes.

Saint Lucia

23. Mrs. Elizabeth JOHNSON from the *Instituto Interamericano de Cooperación para la Agricultura* (IICA) highlighted the high prices fetched by cocoa exports from Saint Lucia and requested to maintain the status of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The experts encouraged the country to use the international standards and protocols for evaluating cocoa flavours.

Jamaica

24. Mr. Gusland-Everaldo McCOOK, from the Jamaica Agricultural Commodities Regulatory Authority (JACRA), requested to recognize the status of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The members of the Panel asked for additional information on the actions implemented to contain the spread of *Frosty Pod* as well as on the country's efforts to secure consistency and quality of its cocoa beans.

Malaysia

25. Dr. Ramle BIN KASIN, from the Malaysian Cocoa Board, presented the Malaysian dossier. The Panel noted that the country's dossier was incomplete and invited to resubmit it to the next meeting.

Panama

26. Given that no representative of Panama was present at the meeting, the Panel agreed to deliberate on the basis of the dossier provided to the ICCO Secretariat which requested Panama to be maintained as a 50% fine or flavour cocoa exporter.

Trinidad and Tobago

27. Mr. Winston RUDDER, from the Cocoa Development Company requested for the country to maintain the status of 100% exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. Experts on the Panel requested clarifications on the levels of traceability and certification of cocoa exports as well as the country's efforts to increase its cocoa production.

Venezuela

28. Members of the Panel noted that no dossier had been submitted to the ICCO Secretariat for Venezuela.

ASSESSMENT OF COUNTRY DOSSIERS BY THE AD HOC PANEL

29. Members of the *Ad Hoc* Panel deliberated during a closed-door meeting.

REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010

30. The results of the deliberations of the Panel are presented in *Table 1*, in alphabetical order.
31. *Table 2* contains the recommendations made by the Panel to the International Cocoa Council regarding Annex “C” of the ICA, 2010 containing the revised percentages of export of fine or flavour cocoa for each country.
32. The Panel of experts agreed to provide countries with individual clarifications on their deliberation.

DATE AND PLACE OF THE NEXT MEETING

33. The date and place for the next *Ad Hoc* Panel meeting will be determined at a later date.

OTHER BUSINESS

34. The Executive Director invited again ICCO Members and the Panel of experts to provide recommendations to the Expert Working Group on the revision of the ICA, 2010 regarding sections related to Fine or Flavour Cocoa, namely *Article 2, paragraph 2* and *Article 39*.
35. In addition, the Executive Director invited Member countries to contact the Secretariat regarding the formulation and the implementation of specific projects related to Fine or Flavour Cocoa.

TABLE 1

DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2019 *AD HOC* PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010

Countries	Council Decision May 2016 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Panel Recommendation April 2019 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Comments and remarks
Belize	50%	<i>a/</i>	Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.
Bolivia	100%	<i>a/</i>	Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.
Brazil	<i>b/</i>	100%	Although cocoa bean exports are small in volume, the Panel acknowledged the presentation of data showing the status of the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa beans.
Colombia	95%	95%	The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage of fine or flavour cocoa bean exports and acknowledged the efforts undertaken by Colombia to ensure that cocoa bean exports are of fine or flavour quality. Questions remain, however, for some of the exports lacking a clear linkage between flavour and the exported beans in light of market measures. The Panel was of the view this could be readily addressed in subsequent exports and efforts to provide this linkage may result in the country becoming an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa in the near future.
Costa Rica	100%	100%	The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.
Dominica	100%	100%	The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel noted the <i>force majeure</i> effects of hurricane damage to the cocoa sector and cocoa bean exports of the country.
Dominican Republic	40%	40%	The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage of fine or flavour cocoa bean exports. The Panel recognized the substantial portion of custom partially-fermented cocoa bean exports presented but found the dossier and presentation lacked clear evidence that this portion was valued because of its fine or flavour characteristics. The Panel would welcome data directly demonstrating and linking these custom fermentation cocoa bean exports as fine or flavour.

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2019 *AD HOC* PANEL ON THE
REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

CONTD.

Countries	Council Decision May 2016 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Panel Recommendation April 2019 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Comments and remarks
Ecuador	75%	75%	<p>The Panel recognized the significant and valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation.</p> <p>The Panel noted that significant work had been carried out in Ecuador since the previous meeting on fermentation and drying procedures which can positively influence the flavour of CCN-51. Despite the tangible efforts, the dossier and presentation did not provide evidence of the valuation of CCN-51 being of fine or flavour standing. The Panel also noted that the new developments in breeding in the country, while not yet a significant part of the cocoa bean exports, should be clearly documented in terms of their fine or flavour status with links to definitive indicators. The efforts in identifying a diversity of flavours within the country are excellent but diversity alone is not sufficient for fine or flavour standing. Each flavour must be linked to a clear demonstration of fine or flavour status in the exported beans.</p> <p>The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage pending review at the next meeting of the demonstrations of fine or flavour status and linkage of this status to specific export lots.</p>
Grenada	100%	100%	<p>The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.</p>
Guatemala	50%	75%	<p>The Panel recommended increasing the percentage of cocoa bean exports considered as fine or flavour based on the information provided in the dossier and presentation. The Panel noted a lack of linkage in interregional exports/transfers, which did not adequately demonstrate that these were of fine or flavour status. The Panel urged the country to provide the linkage data on these exports/transfers.</p>
Haiti	<i>b/</i>	4%	<p>The Panel recognized and encouraged the work within the country to improve fermentation and drying, and ensuring quality cocoa for export. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.</p>
Honduras	50%	<i>a/</i>	<p>Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.</p>

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2019 *AD HOC* PANEL ON THE
REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

CONTD.

Countries	Council Decision May 2016 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Panel Recommendation April 2019 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Comments and remarks
Indonesia	1%	10%	The Panel noted an error in the percentage calculation presented in the dossier. The country used the total cocoa bean production base (internal country consumption as well as exports), not the cocoa bean export base as required. The reduced percentage from the correct calculation was based on the Panel's uncertainty caused by the recognition of smoky beans in the exports. The Panel encouraged the country's ongoing efforts to eliminate smoke taint from the exports and would welcome future demonstration of its work.
Jamaica	95%	100%	The Panel recommended recognizing the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.
Madagascar	100%	100%	The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation, and encouraged the work demonstrating increasing awards linked to exports, exploration of existing flavour diversity, and focus on quality training in coops.
Mexico	100%	<i>a/</i>	Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.
Nicaragua	100%	80%	The Panel reduced the percentage due to the uncertainties introduced by interregional transfers of volumes unspecified and non-segregated by quality type. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation in arriving at this conclusion, but would welcome details on the missing linkages of the specific lots exported in these interregional transfers to fine or flavour status.
Panama	50%	50%	The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage of fine or flavour cocoa bean exports. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2019 *AD HOC* PANEL ON THE
REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

CONTD.

Countries	Council Decision May 2016 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Panel Recommendation April 2019 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Comments and remarks
Papua New Guinea	90%	70%	<p>The Panel noted with appreciation the valuable information presented in the dossier and the presentation. The Panel noted, however, that the country still had problems with smoky flavours in their exports.</p> <p>The Panel recommended to the country's authorities to provide more detailed statistics about their exports, as well as quality reports from buyers, including from regional buyers of cocoa beans, to show improvements with regards to smoky off-flavours. The Panel was of the view that documented evidence was possible in light of the country's initiatives to create a more defined export pipeline allowing full inspections of all exported lots for smoke taint.</p> <p>The Panel recognized the clearly demonstrated fine or flavour status of Papua New Guinea beans which are not smoky but is recommending reducing the percentage of fine or flavour cocoa bean exports due to the lack of definitive information on smoke taint in cocoa bean exports, especially in the regional exports.</p>
Peru	75%	75%	<p>The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage of fine or flavour cocoa bean exports. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation. The Panel noted that some prior CCN-51 plantings were being reverted to locally selected fine or flavour planting materials, with CCN-51 plantings continuing. The Panel was unable to determine the balance of this change in the fine or flavour status of the cocoa bean exports.</p>
Saint Lucia	100%	100%	<p>The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.</p>
São Tomé and Príncipe	35%	<i>a/</i>	<p>Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.</p>
Trinidad and Tobago	100%	100%	<p>The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine or flavour cocoa. The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation to arrive at this recommendation.</p>

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2019 AD HOC PANEL ON THE
REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

CONTD.

Countries	Council Decision May 2016 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Panel Recommendation April 2019 (% of total cocoa bean exports)	Comments and remarks
Venezuela, Bolivarian Rep. of	95%	<i>a/</i>	Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.
Vietnam	40%	<i>a/</i>	Country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel.

Countries presenting dossiers but not recommended for addition to Annex C

Guyana	Requested 60% <i>c/</i>
Malaysia	No Request <i>d/</i>

Notes:

- a/* Fine or Flavour cocoa bean exports are present, but the Panel is not able at this time to evaluate and determine a percentage.
- b/* This country was not previously considered as a producing country exporting fine or flavour cocoa.
- c/* No beans exported in the reporting period 2016/2017 – 2017/2018.
- d/* No percentage was requested and insufficient information was presented for the Panel to determine fine or flavour status of cocoa bean exports.

TABLE 2
ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010
PRODUCING COUNTRIES EXPORTING
EITHER EXCLUSIVELY OR PARTIALLY FINE OR FLAVOUR COCOA

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE 2019 ICCO AD HOC PANEL ON FINE OR FLAVOUR COCOA

(Fine or Flavour cocoa beans as a percentage of total cocoa bean exports of the country)

Countries	Council decision May 2016	Panel recommendation April 2019
Belize	50%	<i>a/</i>
Bolivia	100%	<i>a/</i>
Brazil	<i>b/</i>	100%
Colombia	95%	95%
Costa Rica	100%	100%
Dominica	100%	100%
Dominican Republic	40%	40%
Ecuador	75%	75%
Grenada	100%	100%
Guatemala	50%	75%
Haiti	<i>b/</i>	4%
Honduras	50%	<i>a/</i>
Indonesia	1%	10%
Jamaica	95%	100%
Madagascar	100%	100%
Mexico	100%	<i>a/</i>
Nicaragua	100%	80%
Panama	50%	50%
Papua New Guinea	90%	70%
Peru	75%	75%
Saint Lucia	100%	100%
São Tomé and Príncipe	35%	<i>a/</i>
Trinidad and Tobago	100%	100%
Venezuela, Bolivarian Rep. of	95%	<i>a/</i>
Vietnam	40%	<i>a/</i>

Notes:

- a/ Fine or Flavour cocoa bean exports are present, but the Panel is not able at this time to evaluate and determine a percentage.
- b/ This country was not previously considered as a producing country exporting fine or flavour cocoa.

ANNEX

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

A. MEMBERS OF THE AD HOC PANEL

- | | |
|----|--|
| | Chairman |
| 1. | Mr. Edward S. Seguine
Seguine Cacao Cocoa & Chocolate Advisors, USA |
| | Members |
| 2. | Mr. Pierre Costet
Valrhona, France |
| 3. | Mr. Francisco Gomez
Casa Luker, Colombia |
| 4. | Dr. Darin Sukha
Cocoa Research Unit, Trinidad and Tobago |
| 5. | Mr. Stephen Yaw Opoku
Cocoa Research Institute, Ghana |
| 6. | Dr. Christina Rohsius
Rausch Schokoladen, Germany |
| 7. | Mr. Freddy Amores
Independent, Ecuador |
| 8. | Dr. Ir Misnawi
Indonesian Coffee and Cocoa Research Institute (ICCRI) |
| 9. | Mrs. María Salvadora
Daarnhouwer & Co. BV
Jiménez Rojas |

B. EXPERTS FROM INTERESTED COUNTRIES

Brazil

- | | | |
|-----|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 10. | Dr. Fernando Teixeira Mendes | Director, Ministerio de Agricultura |
|-----|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|

Cameroon

- | | | |
|-----|--------------------------|---|
| 11. | Mr. Michael Ndoping | General Director, NCCB |
| 12. | Mr. J.C. Eko'ò Akouafane | General Director, SODECAO |
| 13. | Mrs. Michèle Akamba Ava | Deputy Director, NCCB |
| 14. | Dr. Narcisse Olinga | Director of External Trade, Minister of Trade |

Colombia

- | | | |
|-----|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 15. | HE Mrs. Claudia Turbay Quintero | Ambassador of Colombia, Ghana |
|-----|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|

Costa Rica

- | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 16. | Mrs. Rocio Fallas Sallas | Ministerio de Agricultura y Ganadería |
| 17. | Mr. Jaime Mora Hernandez | Ministerio de Comercio Exterior |
| 18. | HE Mrs. Marta Juarez Ruiz | Ambassador of Costa Rica, Kenya |

Dominican Republic

- | | | |
|-----|---------------------------------|---|
| 19. | Mr. José Antonio Martínez Rojas | International Relations, National Cocoa Commission |
| 20. | Mr. Idelfonso Medina Garcia | Director of the Cocoa Department, Ministry of Agriculture |

Ecuador

21. Mr. Luis Rueda Dahik
Head of the Coffee and National Fine Flavour Cocoa
Reactivation Project, Ministerio de Agricultura y
Ganadería
22. Mr. Francisco Miranda
President, ANECACAO

European Union

23. Mr. Michel De Knoop
European Commission

France

24. Mr. Stephane Sabourin
Valrhona

Germany

25. Mr. Torben Erbrath
Director, BDSI

Guatemala

26. Mr. Marlon Ac Pangan
Agribusiness Specialist, Ministerio de Agricultura,
Ganadería y Alimentación

Grenada

27. Mr. Benjamin Figarede
Valrhona

Jamaica

28. Mrs. Elizabeth Johnson
Principal Senior Research Scientist, IICA
29. Mr. Gusland McCook
Acting Director General, JACRA

Madagascar

30. HE Mrs. Lantosa Rakotomalala
Ministry of Industry and Trade
31. Mr. Philippe Fontayne
Vice-Président, CNC
32. Mr. Thomas Wenish
Membre, CNC
33. Mr. Ruffin Sambany
Secrétaire Exécutif, CNC
34. Mrs. Edmée Ratefinanahary
Directeur Général du Bureau des Normes de Madagascar,
Ministère du Commerce et de la Consommation

Malaysia

35. Mr. Ramle Bin Kasin
Deputy Director General, Malaysian Cocoa Board
36. Mr. Ngin Sang Yew
Senior Principal Assistant Secretary, Ministry of Primary
Industries

Nicaragua

37. Mr. Jose Miguel Obando
Co-Director, INTA

Papua New Guinea

38. Mr. Jeffrie Marfu
Research Director, Cocoa Board
39. Mr. David Yinil
Senior Agronomist, Cocoa Board

Switzerland

40. Mrs. Safia Bernath
Specialty Cocoa Trader, Barry Callebaut

Trinidad and Tobago

41. Mr. Winston Rudder Chairman, CDCTTL

Venezuela

42. HE Mrs. Belen Orsini Pic Ambassador of Venezuela, Benin

43. Mr. Tomás Camacho Rincones Diplomat, Embassy of Venezuela, Benin

C. *ICCO SECRETARIAT*

44. Mr. Michel Arrion Executive Director

45. Dr. Michele Nardella Director of the Economics and Statistics Division

46. Mr. Yunusa Abubakar Project Manager

47. Mrs. Charlotte Martin Senior Project Officer

48. Mr. Esteban Tinoco Economist

49. Mr. Eugene Nogo Sustainable Development Officer

50. Mrs. Ira Lumbantobing Associate Economist