



**INTERNATIONAL COCOA ORGANIZATION  
ORGANISATION INTERNATIONALE DU CACAO  
МЕЖДУНАРОДНАЯ ОРГАНИЗАЦИЯ ПО КАКАО  
ORGANIZACION INTERNACIONAL DEL CACAO**

**E**

**FFP/REP/8**  
20 June 2023

Original: ENGLISH  
Distr: RESTRICTED

**MEETING OF THE AD HOC PANEL  
ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX C OF THE ICA, 2010**

Radisson Blu Waterfront Hotel, Antananarivo, Madagascar, or Videoconference  
13-14 June 2023, 8.00 – 18.00 UTC+3

**REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE AD HOC PANEL  
ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX C OF THE ICA, 2010**

**(13-14 June 2023)**

## REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX C OF THE ICA, 2010

### OFFICIAL INAUGURATION OF THE 2023 MEETING OF THE ICCO AD HOC PANEL ON FINE FLAVOUR COCOA

1. The 2023 edition of the ICCO *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine Flavour Cocoa was officially inaugurated by HE Mr. Edgard Razafindravahy, Minister of Industrialization, Commerce, and Consumption of Madagascar, President of the *Conseil National du Cacao* (CNC) of Madagascar, and by Mr. Philippe Fontayne, Vice-President of the CNC. They welcomed all participants to the meeting - in particular, the representatives of countries wishing to be listed in Annex “C” of the International Cocoa Agreement (ICA), 2010 - and thanked the experts of the Panel.

2. In his introductory remarks, the Executive Director of the ICCO, Mr. Michel Arrion, thanked the Government of Madagascar for hosting the meeting and for the hospitality shown to participants. He recalled that this was the first edition since the adoption of new internal rules for the Panel and the establishment of a new Panel of experts. He informed the auditorium that the ICCO is celebrating its 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary and invited the Malagasy authorities to participate in the commemoration scheduled for October 2023 in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire.

3. The Executive Director also stressed the importance of developing a fine flavour cocoa segment within the cocoa market as a way to improve the incomes of cocoa farmers, and thus the economic sustainability of the sector.

### OPENING OF THE MEETING

4. The eighth meeting of the ICCO *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine Flavour Cocoa was opened by its Chairman, Mr. Fabien Coutel, Founder and Director of *Treegether*. He introduced the twelve experts of the Panel and invited participants to view this meeting as a platform for exchange, emulation and mutual learning, rather than a competition between countries.

### ADOPTION OF AGENDA

5. The draft agenda contained in document FFP/8/1 was adopted.

### STATEMENT REGARDING ARRANGEMENTS IN RESPECT OF COMPETITION LAW

6. All meetings of the *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine Flavour Cocoa are required to be conducted in accordance with the relevant competition and antitrust laws. In this respect, the Chairman read a statement regarding the compliance with competition and antitrust laws, as well as the confidentiality of the information disclosed during the meeting.

### OVERVIEW OF SUBMISSION OF DOSSIERS AND ORDER OF PRESENTATION OF COUNTRY DOSSIERS

7. The Secretariat gave a brief overview of the twenty dossiers submitted for assessment. Fourteen dossiers were from countries already recognized as producing exclusively or partially fine flavour cocoa in the revised Annex “C” adopted in December 2020 by the ICCO Council (*ref*: ED(MEM) 1145). The remaining six requests were for inclusion into Annex “C” from Cameroun, Ghana, El Salvador, Malaysia, Venezuela and Vietnam.

**PRESENTATION OF COUNTRY DOSSIERS AND QUESTION AND ANSWER SESSION**

8. The country dossiers were presented to the Panel of experts in the following order:

***Malaysia***

9. Dr. Ahmad Kamil Mohd Jaafar from the Malaysian Cocoa Board presented the country's cocoa sector and requested Malaysia to be recognized as exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel asked for clarifications on the volumes and destinations of cocoa exports. The Panel also recommended the establishment of a national system to segregate cocoa beans produced and exported from Malaysia from beans imported and then re-exported.

***Indonesia***

8. Dr. Prayudi Syamsuri from the Ministry of Agriculture requested Indonesia to be recognized as exporting 1.42% of fine flavour cocoa. As during the 2019 Panel edition, experts outlined some discrepancies regarding the data provided on production and exports of cocoa beans.

***Brazil***

9. Mr. Fernando Antonio Teixeira Mendes from the *Comissão Executiva Plano Lavoura Cacaueira* (CEPLAC) requested to maintain the status of the country as exporting 100% of fine flavour cocoa. The experts asked for clarifications on the prices and volumes of cocoa lots exported from Brazil, the expansion of the CCN51 variety, and the presence of cadmium in certain areas of the country.

***Papua New Guinea***

10. Mr. Jeffrie Marfu and Mrs. Claire Parik from the Cocoa Board of Papua New Guinea requested the country to be recognized as a 90% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel requested additional information regarding postharvest techniques and export quality controls implemented to mitigate the issue of smoke contamination. The experts urged the country to improve its current national grading system.

***Vietnam***

11. Mrs. Selene Scotton and Mr. Nicolas Ha from Puratos Grand-Place Indochina presented the Vietnam's cocoa sector and requested to be recognized as a 98.6% fine flavour cocoa exporter. The Panel of experts noted the lack of information provided in the country dossier and asked for clarifications on postharvest practices and farm gate prices. The experts also remarked that the technical information submitted had not yet been endorsed by the Vietnamese authorities.

***Ghana***

12. Dr. Francis Padi Kwame from the Cocoa Research Institute of Ghana (CRIG) requested the country to be listed in the Annex C of the ICA, 2010. The Panel welcomed the submission of Ghana's first technical information dossier and requested clarifications on the national traceability system and postharvest practices. The Panel strongly encouraged the country to pursue the development of its national fine flavour cocoa segment.

### **Colombia**

13. Mr. Oscar Dario Ramirez from the *Federación Nacional de Cacaoteros* (FEDECACAO) requested that Colombia be recognized as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel highlighted the lack of information provided regarding certification labels in the Colombian dossier. The Panel requested more information on efforts implemented to promote Colombian cocoa at the national and international level, and some clarifications on the production and export figures provided.

### **Ecuador**

14. Mr. Andrés Padilla Valverde from the *Ministerio de Agricultura y Ganadería del Ecuador* requested the country to be recognized as a 98.47% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. Highlighting the lack of specific information provided in the presentation regarding CCN51, the Panel asked for clarifications on the proportion of exports and area covered by CCN51, as well as the prices and awards received for exported CCN51 cocoa lots. While recognising the remarkable efforts made in terms of postharvest practices aimed at improving the flavour profile of CCN51, the Panel recommended the country to stop marketing cocoa by variety but rather, like other cocoa producing countries, by geographical area or organoleptic profile.

### **Haiti**

15. Mr. Garry Jerome and Mr. Jean Chesnel Jean, from *Agronomes et Vétérinaires Sans Frontières* (AVSF) requested the country to be recognized as a 20.27% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel noted some discrepancies regarding the data on production and exports of cocoa beans, and missing information in terms of export prices. The Panel asked for more information on national efforts aiming at ensuring the rehabilitation and replanting of cocoa plantations and to make the cocoa sector more attractive to new generations. Clarifications were also provided on the improvement of postharvest practices and national cocoa genetics.

### **Peru**

16. Mr. Jorge Figueroa Rojas from the *Ministerio de Desarrollo Agrario y Riego* (MIDAGRI) presented the country's cocoa sector and requested Peru to be recognized as a 90% fine flavour cocoa exporter. The Panel first deplored the lack of information in the technical dossier provided by Peru. Clarifications were requested on the proportion of CCN51 produced and exported, and on current national traceability systems. The experts also asked for more details on the existence of national strategies aiming at limiting the expansion of CCN51. The Panel strongly encouraged Peru to provide a more complete dossier in the future.

### **Costa Rica**

17. Mrs. Rocio del Carmen Fallas Salas from the *Ministerio de Agricultura y Ganadería* requested that Costa Rica maintain its status as a 100% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel noted some discrepancies in the data on cocoa bean production, consumption, and exports. The Panel requested some clarifications on existing national cocoa grading systems, on inter-regional cocoa movements and on the use of improved cocoa clones.

### **Nicaragua**

18. Mr. Roger Ilich Bolaños Taleno from the *Ministerio de Fomento Industria y Comercio* (MIFIC) requested Nicaragua to be listed as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel noted some

discrepancies in the data provided on consumption and exports, and requested additional information on inter-regional cocoa movements and the share of fermented cocoa being either exported or consumed at national level.

### ***El Salvador***

19. Mr. Jairo Andrade from the Catholic Relief Services (CRS) requested El Salvador to be recognized as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel noted some discrepancies in the data provided in terms of exports and asked for more information on inter-regional cocoa movements. The experts also asked for more details on the share of unfermented cocoa, on the varieties grown in the country and on the current trend towards replacing coffee with cocoa in geographic areas impacted by climate change. The representative of El Salvador briefed the Panel on the vision of the country to cover all national cocoa needs solely through domestic production by 2024.

### ***Cameroon***

20. Mr. Simon Bassanaga from the *Conseil Interprofessionnel du Cacao et du Café* (CICC) requested Cameroon to be recognized as exporting 1% of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel welcomed the submission of a technical information dossier by Cameroon and the detailed information provided on the initiative by *Chocolatiers Engagés* in partnership with the Centres of Excellence. The experts requested additional information on traceability and on the total volumes of exported cocoa lots. The Panel urged the country not to focus solely on cocoa produced in this framework, but in the future, to also consider cocoa produced elsewhere in the country that could be just as valuable as fine flavour cocoa.

### ***Jamaica***

21. Mrs. Shanika Newman from the Jamaica Agricultural Commodities Regulatory Authority (JACRA) requested Jamaica be recognized as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel noted some discrepancies in the data provided in terms of exports. The experts acknowledged the difficulties faced by the country in terms of pests and diseases management, and requested clarifications on the country's vision and current strategies implemented by the government to support the cocoa sector.

### ***Madagascar***

22. Mr. Thomas Wenish, Consultant for the CNC requested to maintain the status of Madagascar as 100% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel requested details on pre-export controls and on significant increases observed in the production areas. Mr. Philippe Fontayne, Vice-President of the CNC and Mr. Didier Andrianarison from the Ministry of Industrialization, Commerce, and Consumption briefed the experts on dumping practices distorting export price statistics and the measures adopted to put an end to these practices.

### ***Grenada***

23. Mr. Robert Medford, from the Grenada Bureau of Standards (GDBS), requested Grenada to be maintained as a 100% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel requested some clarifications on production and export figures, on the national initiatives aiming at mitigating cadmium contamination as well as the organoleptic profiles of cocoa exported from Grenada.

### ***Trinidad and Tobago***

24. Mrs. Mala Partap from the Cocoa Development Company of Trinidad & Tobago Limited (CDCTTL) requested to maintain the status of her country as exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. Additional information was requested on the recent strategies implemented to increase the national cocoa production, based on improved pests and diseases management practices.

### ***Venezuela***

25. Mr. Geovanny Silva from the *Corporación Socialista del Cacao Venezolano* requested his country to be listed as a 100% exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel asked for clarifications on the volumes, prices and destinations of cocoa exports. Some experts deplored a deterioration in the quality of batches exported to Europe due to a lack of traceability and the common practice of mixing cocoa from different origins, which has turned Venezuela from a fine flavour to bulk cocoa exporter. The Panel requested more information on the measures taken to improve traceability and better manage the quality of cocoa lots exported from Venezuela.

### ***Saint Lucia***

26. Despite the submission of a technical information dossier, and in absence of any representative from Saint Lucia, the Panel of experts was not able to assess this case.

## **ASSESSMENT OF COUNTRY DOSSIERS BY THE AD HOC PANEL**

27. Members of the *Ad Hoc* Panel deliberated during a closed-door meeting. They adopted recommendations for each country dossier, as presented in Table 1.

## **NEXT STEPS AND DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

28. The Executive Director recalled that all participating countries had the opportunity to request, within one month (i.e. by 15 July 2023) a revision of the Panel's recommendations on the basis of the provision of additional information. Final recommendations would then be submitted for approval during the next ICCO Council meeting, scheduled for 02-06 October 2023.

29. He clarified that the next ICCO *Ad Hoc* Panel meeting will be held in 4 years (i.e. in 2027), very likely in Asia or Latin America.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

30. There were no items of other business.

## **OFFICIAL CLOSING OF THE 2023 MEETING OF THE ICCO AD HOC PANEL ON FINE FLAVOUR COCOA**

31. In their closing remarks, the Chairman of the Panel and the Executive Director thanked the participants and the Malagasy government for the arrangements made to ensure the smooth running of this meeting.

32. The meeting was officially closed by Mr. Philippe Fontayne and HE Mr. Edgard Razafindravahy.

**REQUESTS FOR REVIEW OF THE PANEL'S RECOMMENDATIONS**

33. In accordance with paragraph 28 of the Internal Rules of the *Panel* (document ICC/104/6/Rev.2), three (3) countries having submitted a dossier to the 2023 edition of the ICCO *Ad Hoc* Panel on Fine Flavour Cocoa lodged requests for review of the *Panel's* recommendation, namely Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela.

34. In addition, the Dominican Republic, which had not submitted a dossier within the deadline to the *Panel*, requested an exemption to remain on the revised version of the Annex C until submission of a new technical dossier at a later stage.

35. In accordance with paragraphs 29 and 30 of the Internal Rules of the *Panel*, a Review Committee was established to appraise the additional evidence provided by Colombia, Ecuador and Venezuela as well as to examine the request submitted by the Dominican Republic.

36. Revised recommendations, as contained in Table 1, were subsequently submitted by the Chairman of the *Panel* to the ICCO Executive Director.

TABLE 1

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020 <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i></b>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023 <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i></b>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023 <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i></b>	<b>Comments and remarks</b>
Belize	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.
Bolivia	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.
Brazil	100%	100%		The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. It noted the dynamism of the national cocoa and chocolate sector and in particular, the recognition of unique cocoa from the Amazon biome.
Cameroun	<i>b/</i>	<i>a/</i>		The Panel recognized the valuable information provided in the dossier and in the presentation which demonstrated the efforts to develop a national fine flavour cocoa sector. It especially noted the efforts to establish Centres of Excellence across the country for postharvest processing and farm traceability. Furthermore, the Panel encouraged the development of a holistic grading system and would suggest the provision of more detailed information regarding market appreciation of quality in the future.



**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Comments and remarks</b>
Colombia	95%	80%	<b>80%</b>	<p>The Panel recognized the good efforts to develop a strong national cocoa sector. Nevertheless, the Panel felt that the percentage requested was too high and did not reflect the current market realities in terms of appreciation of the quality of exported bean lots.</p> <p><b>The Review Committee recognised the importance, in terms of production volumes, quality and price of the cocoa beans traded on the internal market. It also recognised the efforts being made along the supply chain towards the promotion of local genetics, the improvement of cocoa quality and dealing with the issue of cadmium management. When it comes to exported cocoa beans specifically and taking into account the perception of Colombian cocoa in the industry, the Review Committee re-examined the dossier and the additional information provided and remained confident in the Panel’s decision that 80% of total cocoa bean exports being considered as fine flavour reflects more accurately the market reality compared to the previous percentage.</b></p>
Costa Rica	100%	100%		The Panel recommended maintaining the country as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. It especially recognized the existence of diversified sector for certified cocoa exports.
Dominica	100%	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Comments and remarks</b>
Dominican Republic	60%	Removed from Annex C	<b>No recommendation provided</b> (see comments and remarks column for details)	<p>This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.</p> <p><b>The objective of the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Panel on Fine Flavour Cocoa is to assess dossiers submitted by countries wanting to be recognised in Annex C as producing fine flavour cacao. The Internal Rules do not grant the power nor the responsibility to the Panel to allow exemptions to the established rules. The Review Committee therefore considers that such a decision falls outside its jurisdiction and decide to refer the decision to the Council.</b></p>
Ecuador	75%	75%	75%	<p>The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage of fine flavour cocoa bean exports. It noted the efforts to continuously improve postharvest practices regarding CCN-51. Despite these tangible efforts, the dossier did not provide sufficient evidence of segmented valuation of exported bean lots. To do so, the Panel suggested a grading system be considered in order to sufficiently promote the flavour diversity of geographic regions for Ecuadorian cocoa.</p> <p><b>The Review Committee appreciated the additional information provided on the cocoa grading systems used in Ecuador and noted the work achieved to present the sensory profiles of the new EET-clones in relation to CCN 51. The Review Committee renewed its encouragements to Ecuador to provide clearer evidence of how good quality / well fermented CCN51 is segregated along the supply chain and how they compare to the Arriba cocoa. Considering the important increase in the national production, the Review Committee is convinced that maintaining 75% of total cocoa bean exports as fine flavour cocoa is an accurate outcome from the Panel’s deliberations.</b></p>

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Comments and remarks</b>
El Salvador	<i>b/</i>	100%		The Panel recognized the evidence presented to support the inclusion of the country as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa beans. Indeed, it noted the efforts to develop this sector within the last decade, with a particular attention paid to postharvest practices that optimize genetic potential and quality towards niche market appreciation.
Ghana	<i>b/</i>	<i>a/</i>		The Panel recognized the good efforts towards developing a fine flavour cocoa sector leading to the submission of a first dossier. It noted the information provided and recommended that more information be collected to capture a wider range of exports that could be considered as fine flavour cocoa.  The Panel supports continued initiatives in this area.
Grenada	100%	100%		The Panel recommended keeping the country as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. It especially noted the continuous efforts to maintain a high level of bean quality.
Guatemala	75%	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.
Haiti	4%	10%		The Panel noted the high potential of the country as a fine flavour cocoa exporter in spite of extraneous circumstances. It encourages the country to pursue efforts in developing its postharvest processing capacity towards the continuous improvement of quality. Furthermore, the Panel would recommend the submission of more robust information in the future regarding quantities and market valuation of exported cocoa bean lots.
Honduras	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.
Indonesia	10%	10%		The Panel noted again an error in the percentage calculation presented in the dossier. The country used the total cocoa exports (beans and cocoa based products), not the cocoa bean exports only as required.  Nevertheless, it recommended to maintain the same percentage reflecting the positive perception of this origin.

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Comments and remarks</b>
Jamaica	100%	100%		The Panel recommended keeping the country as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. It especially noted the recovery efforts to deal with the negative impacts of frosty pod infestation and maintaining the good quality of exported bean lots.
Madagascar	100%	100%		The Panel recommended the country to be maintained as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa based on the very good and consistent quality of the beans as well as the high market demand for this origin. The Panel noted in particular that the country continues its efforts to realize the true price potential of their exported bean lots.
Malaysia	<i>c/</i>	<i>a/</i>		The Panel acknowledged the excellent efforts to develop a national fine flavour cocoa sector, and believes that the dossier could have better reflected the outcomes of these efforts. The Panel was not able to assign a fine flavour allocation due to concerns regarding segregation of Malaysian beans exported against imported bean lots that are subsequently re-exported. The Panel will continue to encourage the country in its efforts to develop its fine flavour cocoa sector. It would appreciate receiving a more complete dossier in the future and seeing evidence of appropriate measures taken regarding the segregation of re-exported beans.
Mexico	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.
Nicaragua	80%	80%		The Panel recommended maintaining the current percentage of fine flavour cocoa bean exports.  The Panel noted the overall good quality of the beans exported and would support the development of a national grading system for cocoa quality. Nevertheless, the Panel suggested that inter-regional trade be better documented and presented in the future.
Panama	50%	Removed from Annex C		This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023</b> <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	<b>Comments and remarks</b>
Papua New Guinea	70%	80%		<p>The Panel acknowledged the good efforts towards dealing with the issue of smoke contamination.</p> <p>It noted that the current Fair Average Quality (FAQ) grading system used is insufficient towards recognizing current efforts in improving bean quality as bean lots are mixed. The Panel felt that a revised grading system is urgently needed to better recognize good quality and the niche market potential for exported cocoa bean lots.</p>
Peru	75%	75%		<p>The Panel recommended to maintain the same percentage. It noted that the dossier was very incomplete and was not able to allocate the higher percentage as requested. Nevertheless, it recognized the in-country existing efforts towards the maintenance of good quality level. The Panel strongly recommended that concerted efforts be made to provide a more completed dossier in the future to support their deliberations.</p>
Saint Lucia	100%	Removed from Annex C		<p>Despite the submission of a dossier but in absence of an oral presentation, in accordance with the internal rules of the Panel, this country should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.</p>
São Tome and Principe	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C		<p>This country did not submit a dossier for consideration by the Panel and should not be listed in the revised version of the Annex C.</p>
Trinidad and Tobago	100%	100%		<p>The Panel recommended the country to be maintained as an exclusive exporter of fine flavour cocoa. The Panel noted in particular the very good quality of the dossier provided and could only encourage the country to continue in the same vein.</p>

**DELIBERATIONS OF THE 2023 AD HOC PANEL ON THE REVIEW OF ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010**

Countries	Council Decision December 2020 <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	Panel Recommendation June 2023 <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	Review Committee Recommendation October 2023 <i>(% of total cocoa bean exports)</i>	Comments and remarks
Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	<i>a/</i>	<i>a/</i>	<i>a/</i>	<p>The Panel recommended maintaining the same status. Despite the dossier submitted, it noted the lack of detailed and reliable data and was therefore unable to provide a country allocation. It strongly suggested efforts be made to provide more robust data regarding export quantities, quality and traceability.</p> <p><b>The Review Committee thanked the country for the additional information provided on the various systems in place to support the local cocoa sector. However, based on its experience in dealing with commercial bean lots from Venezuela, the Review Committee did not see all these efforts translating into tangible results when it comes to traceability, quality and flavour profiles which have changed significantly over the past years. For the next revision of the Annex C, the Review Committee would like to encourage the country to submit a dossier in coordination with significant and renowned exporters in order to provide a more complete overview of export qualities, volumes and pricing.</b></p>
Vietnam	<i>a/</i>	80%		<p>The Panel recognised the high quality of exported cocoa bean lots. Nevertheless, the dossier was not complete and therefore the Panel was not able to allocate the percentage requested. It encouraged the country to provide a dossier that would better reflect a stronger national coordination of the ongoing efforts in the sector.</p>

Notes:

- a/* Fine flavour cocoa bean exports were present, but the Panel was not able at this time to evaluate and determine a percentage.
- b/* This country was not previously considered as a producing country exporting fine flavour cocoa.
- c/* No percentage was requested, and insufficient information was presented for the Panel to determine fine flavour status of cocoa bean exports.

TABLE 2

**ANNEX “C” OF THE INTERNATIONAL COCOA AGREEMENT, 2010  
PRODUCING COUNTRIES EXPORTING  
EITHER EXCLUSIVELY OR PARTIALLY FINE FLAVOUR COCOA**

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE 2023 ICCO AD HOC PANEL ON FINE FLAVOUR COCOA**

<b>Countries</b>	<b>Council Decision December 2020 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Panel Recommendation June 2023 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>	<b>Review Committee Recommendation October 2023 (% of total cocoa bean exports)</b>
Belize	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C	
Bolivia	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C	
Brazil	100%	100%	
Cameroun	<i>b/</i>	<i>a/</i>	
Colombia	95%	80%	80%
Costa Rica	100%	100%	
Dominica	100%	Removed from Annex C	
Dominican Republic	60%	Removed from Annex C	<i>d/</i>
Ecuador	75%	75%	75%
El Salvador	<i>b/</i>	100%	
Ghana	<i>b/</i>	<i>a/</i>	
Grenada	100%	100%	
Guatemala	75%	Removed from Annex C	
Haiti	4%	10%	
Honduras	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C	
Indonesia	10%	10%	
Jamaica	100%	100%	
Madagascar	100%	100%	
Malaysia	<i>c/</i>	<i>a/</i>	
Mexico	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C	
Nicaragua	80%	80%	
Panama	50%	Removed from Annex C	
Papua New Guinea	70%	80%	
Peru	75%	75%	
Saint Lucia	100%	Removed from Annex C	
São Tomé and Príncipe	<i>a/</i>	Removed from Annex C	
Trinidad and Tobago	100%	100%	
Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	<i>a/</i>	<i>a/</i>	<i>a/</i>
Vietnam	<i>a/</i>	80%	

Notes:

- a/* Fine flavour cocoa bean exports were present, but the Panel was not able at this time to evaluate and determine a percentage.
- b/* This country was not previously considered as a producing country exporting fine flavour cocoa.
- c/* No percentage was requested, and insufficient information was presented for the Panel to determine fine flavour status of cocoa bean exports.
- d/* The members of the Review Committee consider that such a decision falls outside their jurisdiction and decided to refer the decision to the ICCO Council.



## ANNEX

### LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### A. MEMBERS OF THE AD HOC PANEL

##### Chairman

- Mr. COUTEL, Fabien - Treegether, Switzerland

##### Vice Chairman

- Dr. SUKHA, Darin - Cocoa Research Centre, Trinidad & Tobago

##### Members

- Mrs. ARCINIEGAS LEAL, Adriana - *Centro Agronómico Tropical de Investigación y Enseñanza* (CATIE), Costa Rica
- Mrs. MARTINEZ GUERRERO, Nubia - Independent, Peru
- Mr. YAW OPOKU, Stephen - Cocoa Research Institute Ghana (CRIG), Ghana
- Mrs. DOUTRE ROUSSELL, Chloé - Independent, Venezuela
- Mrs. BUDI, Ariza - Indonesian Coffee and Cocoa Research Institute (ICCRI), Indonesia
- Mr. BONNOT, Antoine - Walter Matter SA, Switzerland
- Mrs. PAPALEXANDRATOU, Zoi - ZOTO, Belgium/Greece
- Mr. BINDRA, Simran - Kokoa Kamili, Tanzania
- Mr. SIMONIS, Julien - Independent, Belgium
- Mrs. JIMÉNEZ ROJAS, Maria Salvadora - Daarnhouwer & Co. BV, Netherlands

#### B. EXPERTS FROM INTERESTED COUNTRIES

##### Brazil

- Mr. TEIXEIRA MENDES, Fernando Antonio – *Comissão Executiva Plano Lavoura Cacaueira* (CEPLAC)

##### Cameroun

- Mr. BASSANAGA, Simon – *Conseil Interprofessionnel du Cacao et du Café* (CICC)

##### Colombia

- Mr. DARIO RAMIREZ, Oscar – *Federación Nacional de Cacaoteros* (FEDECACAO)

##### Costa Rica

- Mrs. FALLAS SALAS, Rocio del Carmen – *Ministerio de Agricultura y Ganadería*

**Ecuador**

- Mr PADILLA VALVERDE, Andrés – *Ministerio Agricultura y Ganadería del Ecuador*

**El Salvador**

- Mr. ANDRADE, Jairo – Catholic Relief Services (CRS)

**Ghana**

- Dr. PADI KWAME, Francis – Cocoa Research Institute of Ghana (CRIG)

**Grenada**

- Mr. MEDFORD, Robert – Grenada Bureau of Standards (GDBS)

**Haiti**

- Mr. JEAN, Jean Chesnel - *Agronomes et Vétérinaires Sans Frontières (AVSF)*
- Mr. JEROME, Garry - *Agronomes et Vétérinaires Sans Frontières (AVSF)*

**Indonesia**

- Dr. SYAMSURI, Prayudi - Ministry of Agriculture

**Jamaica**

- Mrs. NEWMAN, Shanika - Jamaica Agricultural Commodities Regulatory Authority (JACRA)

**Madagascar**

- Mr. WENISH, Thomas - *Conseil National du Cacao (CNC)*
- Mr. ANDRIANARISON, Didier - *Ministère de l'Industrialisation, du Commerce et de la Consommation (MICC)*
- Mr. FONTAYNE, Philippe - *Conseil National du Cacao (CNC)*

**Malaysia**

1. Dr. MOHD JAAFAR, Ahmad Kamil - Malaysian Cocoa Board

**Nicaragua**

- Mr. BOLAÑOS TALENO, Roger Ilich - *Ministerio de Fomento Industria y Comercio (MIFIC)*

**Papua New Guinea**

- Mr. MARFU, Jeffrie - Cocoa Board of Papua New Guinea
- Mrs. PARIK, Claire - Cocoa Board of Papua New Guinea

**Peru**

- Mr. FIGUEROA ROJAS, Jorge - *Ministerio de Desarrollo Agrario y Riego (MIDAGRI)*

**Trinidad and Tobago**

- Mrs. PARTAP, Mala - Cocoa Development Company of Trinidad & Tobago Limited (CDCTTL)

**Venezuela**

- Mr. SILVA, Geovanny - *Corporación Socialista del Cacao Venezolano*

**Vietnam**

- Mr. HA, Nicolas – Puratos
- Mrs. SCOTTON, Selene – Puratos

**C. *ICCO SECRETARIAT***

- Mr. ARRION, Michel – Executive Director
- Mrs. BAH, Bérénice Grace – Staff
- Mr. CAMARA, Lacina – Staff
- Mr. JIMENEZ PUERTA, José - Staff
- Mrs. MARTIN, Charlotte – Staff